

ITEM 6A

**SPECIAL EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
MINUTES OF MEETING
MAY 15, 2017**



The audio file for this committee meeting can be found at: <http://www.cvag.org/audio.htm>

1. CALL TO ORDER

The May 15, 2017 Special Executive Committee meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Chair Dana Reed, City of Indian Wells, at Palm Desert Council Chamber, City Hall, in Palm Desert.

2. ROLL CALL

A roll call was taken and it was determined that a quorum was present. Those in attendance were as follows:

MEMBERS PRESENT

Mayor Joseph DeConinck
Mayor Stan Henry
Mayor Steven Hernandez
Mayor Scott Matas
Councilmember Dana Reed
Mayor Pro Tem Mike Wilson
Mayor Linda Evans
Mayor Jan Harnik
Mayor Robert Moon
Councilmember Dana Hobart
Supervisor V. Manuel Perez
Chief of Staff Jaime Hurtado

AGENCY

City of Blythe
City of Cathedral City
City of Coachella
City of Desert Hot Springs
City of Indian Wells
City of Indio
City of La Quinta
City of Palm Desert
City of Palm Springs
City of Rancho Mirage
County of Riverside 4th District
County of Riverside 5th District

MEMBERS NOT PRESENT

Supervisor Kevin Jeffries
Supervisor John Tavaglione
Supervisor Chuck Washington
Tribal Chair Jeff Grubbe
Tribal Chair Douglas Welmas

AGENCY

County of Riverside 1st District
County of Riverside 2nd District
County of Riverside 3rd District
Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians
Cabazon Band of Mission Indians

NON-VOTING MEMBERS PRESENT

Peter Cosentini
Pat Milos
Bill Pattison
Luke Rainey
Dan Martinez

AGENCY

City of Blythe
City of Cathedral City
City of Coachella
City of Desert Hot Springs
City of Indio

Frank Spevacek	City of La Quinta
Lauri Aylaian	City of Palm Desert
David Ready	City of Palm Springs
Randy Bynder	City of Rancho Mirage
Brian Nestande	County of Riverside
Tom Davis	Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians

OTHERS PRESENT

John Anselm	Desert Recreation District
Anthony Alvarez	Cathedral City Resident
M. Arcoli Areaol	Palm Desert Resident
Rosario Avila	Cathedral City Resident
Ken Battle	Palm Springs Resident
Joanna Belaños	Rancho Mirage Resident
Rick Berg	Cathedral City Resident
Robert Brassfield	Cathedral City Resident
Tom Burks	La Quinta Resident
Jennifer Calleros	Rancho Mirage Resident
Livi Calleros	Rancho Mirage Resident
Wendy Campbell	Friends of CV Link
Cindy Cole	Desert Critical Mass
Kevin Cole	Palm Desert Resident
Leticia Collins	Palm Springs Resident
Austin Coulter	Palm Desert Cycling
Steve Coulter	Palm Desert Resident
Deiter Crawford	Palm Desert Resident
C. Cross	Palm Desert Resident
Nancy DeLuna	Rancho Mirage
Amanda Dorta	Palm Desert Resident
Patrick Dugan	Palm Desert Resident
Kathleen Emerson	Palm Desert Resident
Mack Emerson	Palm Desert Resident
Carol Faselli	Palm Desert Resident
Jean Fidelgo	Rancho Mirage Resident
Vic Gainer	Friends of CV Link
David Gassaway	City of Indian Wells
Douglas Goldfarb	Rancho Mirage Resident
Paula Goldfarb	Rancho Mirage Resident
Chris Gregory	US Fish and Wildlife Service
James Griswold	Rancho Mirage Resident
Esperanza Guzman	Lideres Campesinas
Allan Haeberle	La Quinta Resident
Vicki Haeberle	La Quinta Resident
Isaiah Hagerman	City of Rancho Mirage
Dr. Chris Hancock	Desert Doctors
Bob Hargreaves	Cathedral City Resident
Hasan Ikrata	Southern California Association of Governments
Monica Hayes	Palm Desert Resident
Betsie Hewitt	Palm Desert Resident
Les Hewitt	Palm Desert Resident
Andrew Hirsch	Palm Springs Resident

AGENCY

Clapa Hopkins	Friends of CV Link
Tom Horne	Rancho Mirage Resident
Beverly Iron	Indian Wells Resident
Dr. Katrina John	
Sarah Johnson	Palm Desert Resident
Neil Johnson	City of Palm Desert
Mayor Pro Tem Sabby Jonathan	Desert Sands Unified School District
Wendy Jonathan	Palm Desert Resident
Louise Kermode	Friends of CV Link
Emily Kincaid	Friends of CV Link
Hilton Kincaid	City of Rancho Mirage
Mayor Pro Tem Richard Kite	Friends of CV Link
Thomas Kohn	Rancho Mirage Resident
David La Porta	Desert Critical Mass
Max Lara	Leadership Counsel
Patricia Leal	
Alec Longmuir	Friends of CV Link
Gary Lueders	Salton Sea Triatholon
Nathan Mach	Leadership Counsel
Mariela Magaña	Cathedral City Resident
Jenness McBride	Palm Desert Resident
Scott McKelvey	Palm Springs Resident
Lisa Middleton	Rancho Mirage Resident
Angela Miller	Rancho Mirage Resident
Jeff Miller	Palm Desert Resident
Jim Miringoff	City of Palm Desert
Councilmember Gina Nestande	Palm Springs Resident
Anna Nevenic	Inland Empire Biking Alliance
Marvin Norman	Pedego Electric Bikes
Bryan Newman	
David O'Donnell	Desert Critical Mass
Arvin Ocampo	Palm Desert Resident
Diane Oliver	Cathedral City Resident
Pam Orr	Cathedral City Resident
Richard Orr	Pease Chiropractic
Gerald Pease	Palm Desert Resident
Christina Peña	Palm Springs Resident
Mindy Reed	CVAG Volunteer
Murray Quance	La Quinta Resident
Paul Quill	Lideres Campesinas
Manuel Ramirez	Lideres Campesinas
Mariel Ramirez	Lideres Campesinas
Yesenea Ramos	
Daniel Recklah	Palm Desert Chamber
Naran Reitman	La Quinta Resident
Henry Rice	Cathedral City Resident
John Ritter	Cathedral City Resident
Rodnee Ritter	Palm Desert Resident
Linda Rivest	Palm Desert Resident
Randy Roberts	Palm Desert Resident
Jay Rockbank	Palm Desert Resident

Noelle Roman	Cathedral City Resident
Rich Ronzella	
Rany Rotseah	Palm Desert Resident
Jim Rothblatt	Friends of CV Link
Manuel Salas	Indio Resident
Councilmember Steve Sanchez	City of La Quinta
Ed Schiller	Friends of CV Link
T. Scott	Palm Desert Resident
Laren Segara	
Mary Settle	Coachella Valley Hiking Club
Michael Shovlin	La Quinta Resident
Steven Sims	Go Bike USA
Councilmember Iris Smotrich	City of Rancho Mirage
Dr. Christopher Snyah	
Cheryl Stark	Palm Desert Resident
John Stark	Palm Desert Resident
Ryan Stendell	City of Palm Desert
Leo Sullivan	Cathedral City Resident
Mary Lou Suter	Rancho Mirage Resident
Bob Terry	People Over Pollution
Shana Tooley	
Bane Tolseas	Palm Desert Resident
Brian Torsnoi	Palm Desert Resident
Evan Trubee	Big Wheel Tours
Nguyer T.Q. Van	
Debra Vogler	
John Vogler	
Joyce Virture	Rancho Mirage Resident
Barry Williams	
Rocky Wood	Bike Palm Springs
Gary Wright	Palm Desert Resident
Brian Yaklich	Palm Springs Resident
Victor Yepello	Palm Springs Bike Coalition

STAFF PRESENT

Tom Kirk	
Gary Leong	
Martin Magaña	
Katie Barrows	
Jim Sullivan	
LeGrand Velez	
Cheryll Dahlin	
Erica Felci	
Lance Albrecht	
Joanna Stueckle	
Toni Eggebraaten	CVAG Legal Counsel

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Executive Assistant Joanna Stueckle led the Executive Committee in the Pledge of Allegiance.

4. EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE / DIRECTOR COMMENTS

In the interest of time, Chair Reed moved this item to follow Item 6 – Public Comments without objection.

5. CERTIFICATION OF THE CV LINK FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT AND APPROVAL OF PROJECT – LeGrand Velez

Tom Kirk thanked the City of Palm Desert for the use of the Council Chamber and proceeded to explain the process of the public meeting to consider the certification of the CV Link Environmental Impact Report (EIR). Mr. Kirk introduced LeGrand Velez.

Mr. Velez presented the staff report, including the presentation of project history.

It was pointed out that Spanish translation services are available. Public testimony began at 6:25 p.m. The following public testimony was received:

Hasan Ikrata, SCAG Executive Director, expressed strong support for the CV Link project by SCAG and the SCAG Regional Council, made up of 109 city representatives.

David Gassaway, City of Indian Wells, spoke on behalf of the City of Indian Wells. Mr. Gassaway indicated the City believes their comments have not been addressed.

Vic Gainer, Friends of CV Link, spoke in support of the project for a variety of reasons including the CV Link being an attraction that will bring people to the Coachella Valley and a way to address the improvement of health.

Anna Nevenic, Palm Springs resident, expressed opposition to the project, indicating that she believed few people would use the path and that the Coachella Valley should focus on a rail system.

Victor Yepello, Palm Springs Bike Coalition and Coachella Valley Bicycle Coalition, spoke in favor of the project indicating that the CV Link will save lives as it provides safety to its users.

Randy Roberts, Palm Desert resident, spoke in opposition to the project for a variety of reasons, including his belief that it would be dangerous to have Neighborhood Electric Vehicles (NEVs) sharing the path with pedestrians.

Leticia Collins, spoke in favor of the project, indicating that she saw no downside to the project and that the CV Link provided a safe place for those with physical disabilities.

Gary Lueders, Friends of CV Link, spoke in support of the project for safety reasons and cited statistics involving cycling deaths in the Coachella Valley.

Louise Kermode, Palm Desert Resident, expressed opposition to the project, discussing operations and maintenance costs (O&M) and indicated that she supported Palm Desert allowing the issue to go to the voters.

Scott McKelvey, Palm Desert resident, spoke in favor of the CV Link and indicated compromises were made in planning the project and that, though there wasn't unanimous support, there was clear majority support.

Jim Rothblatt, Friends of CV Link, welcomed newly appointed Supervisor V. Manuel Perez and discussed his many years of cycling in the Coachella Valley. Mr. Rothblatt encouraged CVAG to keep up the good work.

Allan Haeberle, La Quinta resident, spoke in support of the project, and asked that call boxes be considered to access emergency services.

Cheryl Stark, Palm Desert resident, expressed her opposition to the project and encouraged the City of Palm Desert vote on the project.

Lisa Middleton, Palm Springs resident, spoke in support of the project, indicating this was a public safety issue, stressing the inequality of a matchup between cyclist and a car on roads.

Jack Ritter, Palm Desert resident, opposed the project due to NEVs and pedestrians sharing the pathway.

Andrew Hirsch, Palm Springs resident, opposed the project and questioned air quality claims.

Bob Terry, People Over Pollution, spoke in opposition of the project, adding that the project would be approved despite the opposition.

Joyce Virture, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in opposition of the project and encouraged a Coachella Valley vote on CV Link.

Naran Reitman, Palm Desert Chamber, spoke in support of the CV Link, indicating that the Jefferson Street project wasn't put to a vote and encouraged the Executive Committee to approve the EIR.

Mary Lou Suter, Rancho Mirage resident, supported the CV Link project going to the voters and stated that she did not support the use of Measure A for the project.

Mary Settle, Coachella Valley Hiking Club, encouraged support of the EIR and discussed her use of trails around the world, adding that the CV Link was safe and effective.

Rocky Wood, Bike Palm Springs, spoke in favor of the project and it's potential to attract tourists to the Coachella Valley.

Jim Miringoff, spoke in support of Palm Desert allowing a vote to consider the CV Link.

Linda Rivest, Palm Desert resident, indicated that she was 100% in favor of the CV Link.

James Griswold, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in favor of CV Link, stating that the project will encourage more people to get active, while increasing tourism in the Coachella Valley.

Dr. Chris Hancock, Desert Doctors, indicated that the CV Link is a public service project that will increase a healthier lifestyle and encouraged a positive vote from members.

Tom Horne, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in favor of the project, expressing his disappointment in his Council and encouraged members to think beyond themselves.

Debra Vogler, Palm Desert resident, indicated the CV Link was a nice project and discussed a project in another community.

Hilton Kincaid, Friends of CV Link and La Quinta resident, spoke in favor of the project for safety reasons and looks forward to his wife being able to ride on the project safely.

Jeff Miller, Rancho Mirage resident, opposed the project, stating that the bigger health issue is the Salton Sea and said that the CV Link will cost too much money.

Paul Quill, La Quinta resident, spoke in favor of the project, adding that he agreed completely with statements made by supporters and stressed the positive impact on health.

Rosario Avila, Cathedral City resident, opposed the CV Link, stating approval of the EIR was a disservice to the community.

Douglas Goldfarb, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in support of the project, indicating that the CV Link will improve business in the Coachella Valley.

Rick Berg, Palm Springs resident opposed the project, suggesting CV Link funding could be spent elsewhere.

David La Porta, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in support of the project and disagreed with the decisions made by Rancho Mirage and Indian Wells to not participate.

Evan Trubee, Big Wheel Tours, spoke in support of the CV Link and indicated that he has seen tremendous growth in tourism, adding that you can't go wrong with adding to the infrastructure of the Coachella Valley.

Mariela Magaña, Leadership Counsel, spoke in opposition of the project, indicating that this was a tourism project that didn't consider the workforce of the tourism industry and asked members to take a closer look at maintenance.

Thomas Kohn, Friends of CV Link, thanked the Executive Committee for the opportunity to discuss the project and urged members move forward with the CV Link.

Patricia Leal, Leadership Counsel, spoke in opposition of the project, indicating that areas of the east valley do not benefit from the CV Link.

Deiter Crawford, Palm Springs resident, supported the CV Link and discussed ways it will benefit the Coachella Valley.

Brian Torsnoi, Palm Desert resident, encouraged a vote of the residents.

Amanda Dorta, Palm Desert resident, spoke in favor of the project, expressing her excitement in the approval of the CV Link as it will stimulate the Coachella Valley's economy.

Nathan Mach, Salton Sea Triathlon Club, spoke in support of the project, suggesting there would be many benefits because of the CV Link.

Austin Coulter, Desert Critical Mass, spoke in support of the CV Link, adding that as a cyclist, it would be much safer to stay off of Highway 111 and Fred Waring Drive.

Max Lara, Desert Critical Mass, spoke in favor of the project due to the safety aspects of CV Link.

Manuel Salas, Indio resident, spoke in support of the project, adding that it will encourage a safe pedestrian option.

Arvin Ocampo, Desert Critical Mass, spoke in support of the CV Link indicating that the path would make it possible to travel through the valley safely and without a car.

Brian Yaklich, Palm Springs resident, spoke in support of the project indicating that the CV link will encourage the coming together of people as a community and revitalize the community.

Robert Brassfield, Rancho Mirage resident, thanked the Executive Committee for the forum, adding that he supported the CV Link as it encouraged a culture of wellness.

Steven Sims, Go Bike USA, stated that cyclists needed a break from the monotony and ways to ride safely into neighborhoods.

Kevin Cole, Rancho Mirage resident, encouraged the Executive Committee to not miss this great opportunity and approve the CV Link.

Dr. Katrina John, Indian Wells resident, spoke in support of the CV Link, adding that though she had cycled in many areas of the world, she feared riding her bike in the Coachella Valley and discussed many benefits of the project.

Bryan Newman, Pedego Electric Bikes, spoke in support of CV Link and indicated that it will meet the needs of many different groups.

Marven Norman, Inland Empire Biking Alliance, spoke in favor of the CV Link and encouraged CVAG to start phase 2 and work on the connectivity.

Mindy Reed, Palm Springs resident, thanked the Executive Committee members for the meeting and the Palm Springs City Council for voting to support CV Link. Ms. Reed supports the project and discussed safety aspects of the project.

Wendy Jonathan, Desert Sands Unified School District (DSUSD), was called to the podium. Ms. Jonathan was unable to stay to give comments, however turned in her speaker card with her comments on it. Chair Reed read her statement which indicated DSUSD support of CV Link and indicated the Board sent a letter of support to CVAG.

Christina Peña, Palm Desert resident, spoke in support of the project as it will make cycling safer.

Public testimony closed at 8:05 p.m. A ten-minute break was taken.

The Executive Committee reconvened at 8:15 p.m. Chair Reed invited Mr. Velez to the podium to give staff's response.

Mr. Velez gave a report on the number of responses CVAG received and included with the staff report, including the letter CVAG received just prior to the public meeting from the City of Rancho Mirage.

Mr. Velez introduced the team working on the CV Link EIR, which included John Criste and Nicole Criste, Terra Nova Planning and Research; Deven Young, Alta Planning and Design; and Charity Schiller, Best, Best & Krieger (BB&K).

Members of the team presented their individual responses to questions not included in the EIR response. Executive Committee member discussion ensued.

Marcus Fuller, City of Palm Springs, requested the Executive Committee members consider a City of Palm Springs' request for an amendment to the staff recommended motion to include the alignment variations on both the east and west sides of North Palm Canyon Drive.

Mr. Kirk requested that the proposed City of Palm Springs amendment be conditional upon identification of outside funding for the bridge (associated with the west side alignment).

IT WAS MOVED BY MAYOR PRO TEM WILSON AND SECONDED BY MAYOR EVANS TO APPROVE THE FOLLOWING AS AMENDED:

- 1) ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION 17-003 CERTIFYING THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (SCH #2013111050) FOR THE CV LINK PROJECT; ADOPTING ENVIRONMENTAL FINDINGS PURSUANT TO THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT; AND ADOPTING A MITIGATION MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM.
- 2) ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION 17-004 APPROVING CV LINK ALTERNATIVE 1, AS MODIFIED, INCLUDING THE WEST SIDE ALIGNMENT ON NORTH PALM CANYON DRIVE CONTINGENT UPON OUTSIDE FUNDING FOR THE BRIDGE OVER HIGHWAY 111 AT CHINO WASH; AND ADOPTING A STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING CONSIDERATIONS.

THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 10 AYES, 1 NAY, 1 ABSTAINSTION AND 5 MEMBERS ABSENT.

**MAYOR DECONINCK
MAYOR HENRY
MAYOR HERNANDEZ
MAYOR MATAS**

**AYE
AYE
AYE
AYE**

COUNCILMEMBER REED	ABSTAIN
MAJOR PRO TEM WILSON	AYE
MAJOR EVANS	AYE
MAJOR HARNIK	AYE
MAJOR MOON	AYE
COUNCILMEMBER HOBART	NAY
SUPERVISOR JEFFRIES	ABSENT
SUPERVISOR TAVAGLIONE	ABSENT
SUPERVISOR WASHINGTON	ABSENT
SUPERVISOR PEREZ	AYE
CHIEF OF STAFF HURTADO	AYE
TRIBAL CHAIR GRUBBE	ABSENT
TRIBAL CHAIR WELMAS	ABSENT

6. PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

4. EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE / DIRECTOR COMMENTS

None.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Upcoming Meetings at 73-710 Fred Waring Drive, Suite 119, Palm Desert:

Technical Advisory Committee – Monday, June 12, 2017 at 11:00 a.m.

Executive Committee– Monday, June 5, 2017 at 4:30 p.m.

Upcoming Meeting of General Assembly:

General Assembly – Monday, June 26, 2017 at 6:00 p.m. at Miramonte Resort & Spa,
45000 Indian Wells Lane, Indian Wells

10. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Reed adjourned the meeting at 9:32 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Joanna Stueckle

Joanna Stueckle
Executive Assistant